Achieving inive ic n ec n c i n w ch i C

Paul Glewwe, Meng Zhao, and Melissa Binder

 $2 \bullet \bullet$ he A_me ic n Ac e_m A n cience A igh e e ve

₿ • 2, •

hevie^{ψ} e, e e in hi v me e h e he e ch c n i n e n nece i h e he^{ψ} ice n e ^{ψ} he Ame ic n Ac e A n cience i ec n inve **p** ic n e c n c i n

e e i ec in i ie Ame ic nAc em A n cience ving ee C m i ge A \cdots e e h ne \cdots i i m c g i i w e i e w w w m c g

Con en

v PREFACE

1 CHAPTER 1 A ining Inive in ch ing 2 • An v in C in e Paul Glewwe and Meng Zhao

35 CHAPTER 2 he C vi ing €nive ec n c i n in , eve , ing C n ie Melissa Binder

69 CONTRIBUTORS

 ψ i ence e in hete e c n ie ψ he e he ve gete en e c i ψ e h n in c n ie h e et

e ch, e [₩] e e evie[₩] e n i c e e, e ng [₩], h, he in 2 •• he A_me ic n Ac e_m in C_m, i ge ch e n i i n eve lash , h, ici, n inc e -e ie le vi Ame ic n Ac em ei line vinive i ev e, ic 📭 👎 n / 🗜 n / vi C nning, v 🕯 nive i i ing Cheng, Inive i ng ng me i nce c Ame ic n Ac $e_{\mathbf{A}}$ $\mathcal{L} e^{\psi \psi} e^{-\psi}$ inne $\mathcal{L} e$ ge ng \mathbf{A} Ace, cin/eve/, en , en , in ni e e h man e imene , p n, een —e^ti.Cen e \mathcal{L} , eve , eve , eve , ine - c, hee , \mathcal{L} n. A in ing , p. n. n. i ive i appen n inpling , 🕻 n ehn he, ici n n į iin n 👝 evie^We heie, eme v ec maen A eci hn i e een Che Americ n Ace ma ¹⁴ heine eccniin $c \neq i ing n \neq ec c = in i nh ve een in i en e -e ie$ pe[™]i viinne e hi∕ chie e ec ive ice he A_me ic n Ac e, e hi e c i e

he ***** A < ec. c e n he i n e he e n n he c n e ence vi ing he e iv en i n e c n e c i n i he^w chi en hi n g hi ne in e i e he ***** A < ec </pre>, i he he A

- ic. c , e c i n n hen e n i he h n e i n he e c ,
- he hi e chieve nive e c i n n / i ic c e h he e h ve enc n e e,
- -heg, i_{m} n ec n e c i n in i e en e ing n h^{ψ} , ge ψ h eg i e e,
- -hehnecin, n
- -ecn eicn cicne ence g e cin e nin

he c $(\mathbf{n}, \mathbf{e}, \mathbf{i})$ chieving nive (i c n e c n e c i n e e n e n he n n inge i ci i ne n nece i e i ci i n ig $\forall \mathbf{e}$ i ne i ci i n i ne n i n n c \mathbf{e} i n c (i n) c i ng n h i n e c n e c i n \mathbf{i} ing , ec ive [₩] e h , e h he ★PA , ec [₩] i cce e n en ich e c i n eve , een

hi eci e e ning heii n $e^{i/2}$ e ninn gene gn hn ee heg en mi nin ce nnnn nhe AmeicnAc e A ncience he ec enei he vice i ing i he vi ce i ee^{4/2} hen me e he c he ve

A $\forall ih$ (\mathbf{P} cc in , e , he A_me ic n Ac e_m e , n i i) he viet , e en e he e $\forall ih$ he h

e C hen	, vi 💕 🚎	in in
Rockefeller and	Harvard University	American Academy
Columbia Universities		of Arts and Sciences



PAUL GLEWWE AND MENG ZHAO

The he i entries every end C , e he finite i n in each i h eve chi c e e i ch 2 hi , e e ine eve ecen ie h e c c e hec ace ing hi g g e h e e i ing ie i ci e h he in, ie ining hi g i c ch n e che W hich i W h hei c e i e c n, i ing e ch n hi ing e e che e he e e e e vi ence h he in, e i h h e in en in eve ing c n ie ch en en hei chi en he ch c en vi, e en ch icei he in, e hen he i ing c e i e e he i cevn in n e i ei n^{W} n, W h c n, e ne in ce en n n en e chi en en hei chi en ch he e e e wi n gge he e chnee e ing c e i e e W

In e en e 2 ••• he in e in e e in $e^{i\psi}$, Ci , c n ie en e eigh i enni eve en g, gin ve he i i e in eve ing c n ie he e 2 • he e c n he e eigh g i chieve, nive in e c i n en ing h eve chi ini he in ch A h gh he g e c e ge he n e_{i} in h^w in he ge

heinenin in nive i e c i n.he e e e nive i i c i e i n i $\forall h$ i ic ch nge c n, ing \forall C in eve i ing c n ie e c n h $\forall i$ i ch ii n i ne $\forall i$ e nee e i e en h e i icie eve e i e h i n $\forall i$ e nee e i e en h e i icie eve e i e h i n $\forall i$ e ge he e h e e n e i n h ve e e n i i he ince $\bullet \bullet i$ n $\forall i$ e ge he e h e e n e i n e e i e e n $\forall i$ e he i he e e n e h h ve e e n e n $\forall i$ e he e c n e i n e e n i i h e e i e e n he i icie nee e in \forall C C e he v i i h e e i e e e n he c c he i e e i n

Table 1: Distribution of Developing Countries by	Income Level	and Region
--------------------------------------------------	--------------	------------

	Low Income		Middle Income	
Region	Number of Countries	Population (millions)	Number of Countries	Population (millions)
Sub-Sahara Africa	39	608	8	50
East Asia and Pacific	9	380	13	1469
South Asia	6	1338	2	19
E				

i e inc a e c n ie , he e ig e ge e e cing Chin cce in i e c i n An he en ^W inc a e c n ie n ^W en ai e inc a e c n ie e, n c. chieve C 2 • he ge e he c n c a e n h c n in i n ine en a con e he c n c a e n h c n in i n ine en a con e e e n c a e n h c n i n i n e en a con e highe 2 • he e c n ie c n i e i n ^W inc a e c n ie n i e inc a e c n ie h n i n e e e i en c n ie h ^W i in heg C 2 • ^W hie c e c n he i n in ai e inc a e c n ie i ve inc n ie h ^W i in hig

he emining c n ie eeihe n e ece in \checkmark C n m e c n ie e hei ge emi ing he... c. c n ie c n e ivi e in $\forall \forall \neq e$ he im c e ei n e e e c. c n ie e ece ege e h n e ecen e h n e e en $2 \bullet \forall$ hie he im c e en $\forall e$ n \forall inc mec n ie ecen he in inveinc n ie h e e e c. in ining heg \checkmark C ecen iveinc n ie h e ei c. n e ecen iveinc n ie \forall ih ei e n e e c. in ining heg \checkmark C ecen iveinc n ie h e ei c. n e ecen iveinc n ie \forall ih ei e e c. in ining heg \checkmark C ecen iveinc n ie h e ei c. n e ecen iveinc n ie \forall ih ei e e e c. in e n e ecen iveinc n ie \forall ih ei e e e c. in e ecen iveinc n ie \forall ih ei e e e c. in e ecen iveinc n ie \forall ih ei e ecen iveinc n ie h e ei c ining \checkmark C $2 \bullet$

he ig e in (e, e) give he i e i n c i i eg ing he chieve en $(f C in)^{(W)}$ inc e eve (ing c - n) ie (e) e cen he (f i - n) he c n ie e e i en c n ie h e c (c, e)e i (c, e) we ve in the ec n ie i chi en (f i - e) e e (in - e) he e c n ie i chi en (f i - e) e e (in - e) he e c n ie i chi e (f i - e) e e (in - e) chi c (e - e) e i n e (f - e) e (f - e) i (f - e) e i n n ai einc aec n ie c eg i e he ein $(e n \cdots e)$ e een chi en in $(c \cdot \psi)$ inc aec n ie c $(e \cdot e)$ ee ch n hi n $(e \cdot e)$ ec e ince e $(e \cdot e)$ en in hec n ie h e, ei $(c \cdot g)$ h i $(e \cdot e)$ en in ie i he i i n $(e \cdot e)$ heec n ie h $(e \cdot e)$ $(e \cdot e)$ n $(e \cdot e)$ ec en in $(e \cdot e)$ e he ec n ie h $(e \cdot e)$ $(e \cdot e)$ n $(e \cdot e)$ ec en in $(e \cdot e)$ e he ec n ie h $(e \cdot e)$ $(e \cdot e)$ n $(e \cdot e)$ ec en in $(e \cdot e)$ ec en $(e \cdot e)$ ec e $(e \cdot e)$ n $(e \cdot e)$ ec en in $(e \cdot e)$ ec e $(e \cdot e)$ n $(e \cdot e)$ ec en $(e \cdot e)$ ec e in e e $(e \cdot e)$ ec en $(e \cdot e)$ ec e in e e $(e \cdot e)$ ec e i i n c n i e n , e cen he, i ch ge, i n he e c n ie, n he , e cen ive in c n ie ^w i h i ing h c, , , , , e c e hei e in hi g , , e i n , e e ci i e i i ici hi , e e in , e ign i he c eg i e , h A ic hi e c i ici n h ini e e c A , e i n ge in C , 2 • i i n e in n he c c i n in hi , e n he c ining C , 2 •

Table 4:

CUPP N C S S PI P UC I N

hi ecin, e en eve , ingc n ie nc en g ve n, en e e, en i e n, i e c i n inc ing, h ec en c n c, i c pec e e i e nh eh e, en i e ne c i n e n v i, e n c n i e n, ec e, e, g, chieve Cinevi, ^W i, e in nce, g ve n, en n g ve n, en e, en i e e c, en e he e he ec i n hen c e n c n i e ^W hich Ci ni, e e ine, 2 e, e en ing h ivi e c in e che c n he c

Total Current Cost

nc enc , e ene in e vie, e eve ing c n ie hi ecin, e en h e egin inc e eve n n c, ve c

n he e 2 ••• h nA icnc n ie en , i i n n , i i n en in i ch , e , i e e n ve ge hi ve gei in e , ivec n ie **P** W n C e e e ii hA ic n i , W e h h ve e ine C n en n ve ge , e en e e n nec n e che e W hich e i ing nen en , en ing e , i i , n W n e • e en e e , c ing he e c n ie e ve e en en ing e c n ie h e n c chieve C 2 en h e c n c n ie h e e i c h h nc n ie n n h ve , n i n e e en e en ch W i h ve W , en ing, i i n h e W h e en e en ch W i h ve W

he eve , ing egi n^w i h he ^w e , en ing , e , i <u>e</u> n n h , • n<u>e</u> n e o

Table 5:

Aihhege, in hegin Wih, iin $e \in hegven, en in hecnie en 2, iin n, i$ $<math>e \in ineche ihe iin en in, i ch hi$ ie nvege, e en e e hivegeive i ic c nie eg e hei C nec n ic neih n n en en en en 22, e en e e, hic n i in he, c eg Ai in e n c hec n ie h hve e chieve C en igh e e, i ee ... Whiehen c in Cime, en o n heh e c en heig e ..., i e e e c ine n c heige ..., i e e e c ine n c heige ..., i e e e c ine n c heige ..., i e e e c ine n c heige ..., i e e e c ine n c heige ..., i e e e c ine n c heige ..., i e e e c ine n c heige ..., i e e e c ine n c heige ..., i e e e c ine n c heige ..., i e e e c in

he he hee egin \cdot e n Cen A i he i e n hA ic n - in A me ic n he C i e n \cdot en \cdot en \cdot ch me e e en \cdot e e n ic \cdot n \cdot e \cdot ec ive A e \cdot ine \cdot ve hi \cdot e e n ic \cdot e n Cen A i in e i ning - in A me ic g e e \cdot en ing \cdot e en c \cdot e \forall i h mi i n en in \cdot in ch i me i h 2 i i n i \cdot en \cdot e \cdot e i h egin \forall n i e h c c e i n e \forall een \cdot en ing \cdot e \cdot e \cdot \bullet \forall \cdot i me

••• "miin

Teacher Costs and Non-Teacher Costs

heicinh he mine c gven men ving

An Earlier World Bank Estimate

pe e he, ic i n pe ne 2 ● he e e ch … he 📭 n / ce e i e he c ining eigh i enni 👝 veve veen G vev ne 200 Given he e ive h engh he e n i ec ive c c ing he c eigh g he , e e im, e meh c c e hec ining & C, 2 • , een e in ch in ≇ C , ● , **m**iin n , **m**i⁄ie hi, ne e i e hec en ing chi in ch he ve ge c ve eve ing c n ie ine ivi ing ec en , en ing n, i, e c i n in he e c n ie hen , e chi enen e 2 he meinc / e / im ch / / i c c e e e echegin, he ve gec e en c c e e e echcn, n, gevegecee mine e e e ch c n e ine e cen $\mathcal{L}_{\mathcal{L}}$ e cen i hi e ce e ign e // ing[₩]h. # ••• 2 • n #e n ec n #icg[₩]h ihhee e h c c e he e i c e v n e e i e he $\frac{1}{\sqrt{10}}$ ing nn c in $\frac{1}{\sqrt{10}}$ c. eve $\sqrt{10}$ ing c n ie, iin, iin, en e h h gh e e cive he h cen i i e e c e in , ec e i i \mathbf{a} , ie \mathbf{a} ch highe , en ing , e , , i in A i n - in Ame ic c me he c en eve en ing n he i i n c inc e n n en ing ne³ chi en inc e ing he 🛻 n en nchi en e en e 🎜 ec e he e 🖤 egin e e ing[₩] e in ining ***** C hi cen i ee, in . . . i e

An he $||\mathbf{F}||_{n, n}$, $e : i = 2 \cdot 0$, $e \cdot e \cdot n$, $e \cdot i = e \cdot e$ he i $\mathbf{e} : \mathbf{e} :$

A UNICEF Estimate

i ne , e en e in e, ingc c n he e, ne en men e gvenmene, en i e n, in e c i n n in $\frac{1}{2}$ e i n hi. A he in i c in i n, e n he hi $\frac{1}{2}$ e i n hi give c e i m e c c c i n c in he e c he e n c in h he e i m e c e e n e i

cen n he $e^{i\psi}$ e e n g e e e i i n hen eve chi $i\psi$ ini h i e ch n h $f C^{i\psi}$ e ine he h he f C $e^{i\psi}$ he i e i ing $e^{i\psi}$

Α

n G c gn e c n i e h e e cen i e i e h e c chieving C he i e h e n ing e i i nch nge n h h he i e che i i nch nge n e ch c n i e e n ing e i i h nee e e in ne i en en e e e i ing hi cen i he h e i e h nn c i ince e 2 i i n e i e e i n ing e e i i i ning e

Some Problems with these Estimates

A hee hee ie nee e a e ia i ing a in in hei e ia e n he a in a e en ign e vica ic ing c hear e ia i ing a in a ein h^w eve he a e i e i h hee ia e e in cc e he a in hee ie e a i e in e

A ing hi n e , , i ve eve , ing c n ie e he²² e i i n ig e e in he

[.] heelige ecce 🚬 a i inghennige i e in te the

Table 7: Selected Characteristics of the Four Cost Studies

	Devarajan	UNESCO	UNICEF	Bruns
Includes capital costs?	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Allows for economic growth?	No	No	No	Yes
Include AIDS & orphan cost?	No	No	No	Yes
Adjusts for private schools?	No	No	No	Yes
Accounts for repeaters?	No	No	Yes	Yes
Scenarios to raise school quality?	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Cost comparison made	Adding new students, relative to current students	Adding new students, relative to current students	Adding new students, relative to current students	Gap in what countries can finance and what is needed
Number of countries included in cost comparison	About 150	151	128	47
Annual cost estimate, billions US\$	10–15	9	14–17	0–6

Sources: Authors' summary based on the four studies.

e ... iv e ch n he he h n e n ve e i e c iv e ch e in nce ... en ... iv e g ni i n e g ch ch e n ince e n e en in ... iv e ch e ce e he in n ci en n ... ic ch ... n h n he g ve n e e n ge

he e he e ie ive e i e he nn c chieving $\mathbf{C} \in \mathbf{W}$ een , i i n n , i i n he n \mathbf{W} nge e i n \mathbf{M} ing ec e he e e h h ve e i i i e h n i e ence A h he **F** n he c h i c e in \mathbf{M} e e i e \mathbf{W} e e e n he h c ing i e in hi ec i n h ghn \mathbf{W} c nvincing

The Most Serious Problem with these Estimates

In ne hee hee ie n helf ne ...e. (a - b) = (a - b) + (

n he ie ic e hen e chi en en e in ch i i i i hec e en he e en cen ve gec e en che e ci e e ne $\forall i$ i e cen i i i e chi en hec com ing he e en $\forall i$ hi e in ining cen i e che i n hec ining C e c he ic i e $\forall h$ heve i e e hec ing chi en $\forall h$ he c en n en e in chi e heve gec cen en e chi en $\forall h$ chi e e

he ec n cen i h (\mathbf{m}, \mathbf{e}) ch e ci e e i ne in \mathbf{W} hich he in e n h chi en i i ch ge en en e in ch i h he e en ch vi e i he he ne e ch i \mathbf{W} he ne e ch i n c nn i n e en \mathbf{P} ne \mathbf{W} h e hi cen i i i i he ch he \mathbf{W} i c \mathbf{m} e.

🖆 n n e he 👝 i n ehin hi ec n ine / e i n i nie e ein n eve ingen ie n^ween n e e n h chi en ini h in ch $\mathcal{L} e^{\psi \psi}$ e n 🕻 in 2 🐽 nheh e innie 🚛 inie e in2 🐽 👘 h eh in • a nici i ie • e cen h eh e e h he h hene e , i, ch i $\sqrt[4]{i}$ hin \bullet in $e^{\sqrt{4}}$, ch cce i n 👝 🗸 e a eveninc ana niie 🦞 he e 🖓 ian ch c an e i n e e ^w Acc ing e i nn i e e in he e e nici , i ie in ••, he. ^wing ig e e. **a** he •**a** nici i ie h ^w/ e e he c n g / , e cen h = ng ₂ , chi en ge .₂ , / e cen h e ch , e cen he e, • chi en h e , e n h 🖤 n ini h, i, ch en e, e he, in e n hei chi en h \dots e he h ee in e n $\forall i$ e e chi n in e e e in ch , , e cen , ec n , aic , , e a , , , , e cen n chi , a ₩ , , , e cen P ne 2, e cen, ne, e

chi i nee e 🤟 , h 🗯 , e cen n , en vie[®] e c i n h ving i ev e_{22} , e cen \Re n, e cen e, e h he ch i i hen in ch he e che ^wee e he e in e cen e n e h he in e n chi en ψ e e n en e^w h ch i e, en ive n, he chi i nee e h e^{n} e cen i h he ch i ψ i n nei 👝 💴 e c nee 👝 e / . 2 🐽 / in h e e nininhen e ch in n nei in her o cinci e^wihnince ein hezien en en en e e con in e cen in e ch c n c i n[₩] n ne ec ge / n / e e c i n e e in he n ne i n g ve namen ear ve / ian ch en anen ee e ve hear ive ince e in / i a ch c n c i n ^W hich e hen a e , in ch in n ne i in even e i i n e e e cen en "men e veninc nie hcnine hve ei / e, m ^Wihch vi i, hen neine ei ie e heein evi ence h , i ing , e ch i ...icien in 🕯 C

hen necncin $\forall \psi$ heceime he ie ice ve $\forall \psi$ e het ne ice ve $\forall i$ h he eihe ve he ein $h^{\psi} \neq C^{\psi}i$ ve chieve he even heg in cce ve in h hen ve the even ch Aileen we h e in ing hech in ing $\neq C$. $e^{\psi}c$ nie i ve ne ve ic in hece in even ve ic in hece in even

C NICS N 2 N C S S I S

Assumptions

i e n e (m, m) in given h he ec i n e e n he e 2 • n (m, m) h e ch nge (m, m) ve i e eve (m, m)ing c n ie (m, m) h e he (m, m) h e ch nge ve i e (m, m)(m, m) h e he (m, m) h e ch nge ve i e (m, m)(m, m) h e ch nge ve i e (m, m) h e ch nge ve i e (m, m) h e ch nge ve i e (m, m) h e ch nge ve i e (m, m) h e ch nge ve i e (m, m)

An he $(\mathbf{w}, \mathbf{i}, \mathbf{n})$ in h h (\mathbf{w}, \mathbf{n}) ic in c i he g e e e i n e e e e hi e e e mine he c $\mathbf{n}, \mathbf{w}, \mathbf{e}$ e n ve ge h chi en in in ch he (\mathbf{p}, \mathbf{n}) e en (\mathbf{w}, \mathbf{e}) cen i (\mathbf{w}, \mathbf{e}) e cen i (\mathbf{w}, \mathbf{e}) hich e e i i n e e (\mathbf{e}, \mathbf{e}) e c n n (\mathbf{w}, \mathbf{e}) on n e i cienci (\mathbf{w}, \mathbf{e}) en en i he e c n cen i (\mathbf{w}, \mathbf{e}) e n n e i cienci (\mathbf{w}, \mathbf{e}) e en i he e c n cen i (\mathbf{w}, \mathbf{e}) e cin ing e e e i i n e e (\mathbf{w}) e c n i e (\mathbf{w}) i h e g e e h n e e e e i n e e

A hi $(\mathbf{m}, \mathbf{i}, \mathbf{n}, \mathbf{c}, \mathbf{n}, \mathbf{c}, \mathbf{n}, \mathbf{m}, \mathbf{c}, \mathbf{c}, \mathbf{n}, \mathbf{m}, \mathbf{n}, \mathbf{n}$

$c ne^{W} c \times clsc_{t} 2$

ch nge in hen e e che e c *e .tchpcls* he e eing ne in ic ch i

$ne^{i/2}c$ $n \leftarrow ch , tchpcls , n \leftarrow ch , tchpcls ,$

hen e e che in n e , n e ch i e e mine hen e e en in , i ch , ivi e he i eve , , i e che i , puptchrat

n \leftarrow ch .puptchrat_t .

hen e en i e e in he r in he n *totpop* he cin he in h e in h e r in he ch ge *prim age*% heg en e ge n he e cen in ch en $\frac{1}{2}$ h e in iv e ch *priv*%

. primage% \times totpop_t \times ge \times . priv% .

he e i c c e heg en men e chi en en in i i ch he n gezeg e n he $e^{i/2}$ e en g e e e i i n i i/2 e he ve ge ve i e en gez e e e c hen me e chi en en e ivi e he n me e chi en h ge he i e chi en en he i e chi en he in ze zimmate in zim ch ze zim chi en h even en in zim ch n he e zim ch c ×.

🗯 e 🛛 gdp ×gvrv%gdp ×edsp%gvrv ×prsp%edsp 💪

n he i m i n grrv%gdp i e , e cen he, e $\forall \psi$ inc me c n ie , e cen $\forall \psi$ inc me c n ie $\forall \psi$ h e, e c, i

h, ing n hing. en men h en men $\forall i$ e i e hene e $\forall \psi$ en ive cen i e he, in chi en en e e ive hen me ch ge chi en inch nge, n 2 he en men en me ch ge chi en inch nge, n 2 he en men en me com 2 ••• 2 • $\forall \psi$ he me inc en h i $\forall \psi$ e me ince en h i ψ e me ince en h i ψ e me ince en h i i n in he me n i i i n in he e $\forall \psi$ hich e ce he nn c i i n n i i i n e e cive

he cen i h eccive he en i n in help n e i cen i ee e hi c c e he c chieving $C_2 \circ$. U hi e i ne i ving ch i enh n cinge i cienc n ince inge ii i n e ic in n ci e ce in e hi cen i he c ining $C_2 \circ U$ ince e 2, i i n, e i c e ce in e i n cinge i cience i he c i ining $C_2 \circ U$ ince e 2, i i n, igh U e i i n ve e z i i n e e

cen i 2 n ee e he he cen i eene in hepe ne cen i 2 e e e imen h c n i e ^wh h ... en hee im e ¹/₁ hen me, me e ech nge Pre, en i ciici he **B** n cen i i h he **e e g** ^W h e e cen ^W hich **e e i m** i i c e e ci **h** n A i c n c nie ceni, e he 👝 in ceni, 👝 e h ⊊ g^wh. *e* ●●● 2 ● ^wie hevege⊊ g^whe. [₩]hen hi 👝 in ich nge 🗸 👝 e ice ce ec ine igh 🔪 c ec ine, ec e e che ie ie g, e c, i ec ine igh cen i e ecin, he $g = \frac{1}{2} h e ec$ in e i ai ic in aing highe hn e cen g ^W hin a egin , heince eine ce i 👝 che , ince e c in e che ie ginheeiiee.ec nheg/ ceni, 👝 e 👝 e , e i, mi ic ⊊ g ^W h n , e cen A e, , ec e , me ic e ce he in meicci me he me heeive i e ch nge in he in ncing g / c 👝 e cen i cen i 👘 "me "me cin en in ivech hihie e.ec nhe i, in e

A chile en vice e geieche ie ehe chineven h ghoug $^{\psi}$ hilve e cen cen i die venen het e che cen i die venen het e che die ehe chineven het e che chinge in me ice ce die ehe chin hee in hee in hile in nive die venen die venen het e che hile in nive die venen het e che cen i die venen het e che hile in nive die venen het e che cen i die venen het e che hile in nive die venen het e che cen i die venen het e che hile in nive die venen het e che cen i die venen het e che hile in nive die venen het e che cen i die venen het e che die venen het e che cen i die venen het e che

venen in chi i inc venen i h gh e cinin he vi e che i inc n ie whee h n e ci highe h n \bullet h gh n ince e in e che i e n n n e che ven ing e c n ie

icienc enh nce en i c c e e c i n in e che i e in c n ie $\frac{1}{\sqrt{1 + 1}}$ i h e ive high e che i e n in i ing, i e che i $\frac{1}{\sqrt{1 + 1}}$ e in c n ie $\frac{1}{\sqrt{1 + 1}}$ he e h e e h n e

Region Scenario 7: Total Cost (millions US \$)

Domestic Resources (millions US \$)

Financing Gap (millions US \$) Region

Domestic Resources

Financing Gap (millions US \$)

cen i 2 e _mine he e i , i e che i e ^w e i e \mathbf{a} e en e en e he \mathbf{a} in e he \mathbf{a} e h e in cen i hi \mathbf{a} e n h n ne^{ψ} ch e i n n ne^{ψ} e che e hie, in e. ec 🙀 e chi en ec 🖤 e in e i ing c 🍡 🙍 👘 e hi cen i c e ch ^w e h n e ic e ce e ing in ncing , i i n ven h n A ic h ch i i n wee hei, i e che i e i e high in

he in , en in , c, ch h^{ψ}, aigh iin , n, e e inceech en en ne, i ii , i i e ch ing , vi ing, en , en c n i i n n hei chi en eing en e hi , i h , een e e in eve c n ie , eg : ng e h : i Chie , n e ic n ic g n e^{ψ} , he e c n ie ; icie , vi ing , i ie ^{ψ} e e in e e ne ing n ei e i ^{ψ} hich, , vi e he e e in e he in, c , ch, icie n ch en en n n ic g , vi e^{ψ} e cen e e e g e^{ψ} e n i i e 2 e, he , i ie ^{ψ} e n n en c , , , n , e hei e_{A} ch e_{A} e e_{A} e nive hen he, i he ch n he $\frac{1}{2}$ i c e_{A} e.

hee, e he^w c chi en ch heeic en ve i e e e ch n hi 🚬 ec Ani, 🛶 n e ce i n 🔍 in n eceie, nine / Aicncni , ige n e a 2 • hei a ch vi ing a e i ce a en ine in , i e h n ch en nce he n h , vi ing ^w c, cen e e e e e icine ince e ch , ici, i n,[™] hich inc , e , h en nce n en , even /e cen ge/ in hi e hi i e/ c i n ve ge/ e he vie[®]/ in / e ching ***** C i high igh ne e e, en ive e n ive , i ie hi , ic en ive ,, ie n in e ing [₩] he e high, e cen ge chi enhve e e hev eve ine in i e ^which i n he ce 👝 eve ing c n ie 🔍 i gge h he h, 🛻 e ig ni ic n c in e e ining^W he he chi en en n / ici/ e in / i 👝 ch i, i e h, g 👝 i👝 ving chi he h^wi nee e / icie chieve 🕯 C n he e he c ch / g 👝 👝 eine i eine i hec 👘 ining 🕯 C he , , ch e , he ie evie[®] e in hi , , e i , e n n inc ec e inc 👞 e e n e n ing .^W h 👝 n chi en in a chi^wic in nive in ch carein ec en

 $ne n^{\psi} \psi h$, icie c n chieve h g ... ec ive, icie , e e nive , i e c i n n he c c i n i c e e e n ne^{ψ} e e ch n he e in n ch en en in eve, ing c n ie

C NC USI N

every ing c n ie e ing e ge $\forall \forall c$ hec en e in venenii nie h he $\forall i$ in h g 2 • -gging ehin he e he $\forall i$ in h g 2 • -gging ehin he e he $\forall i$ h nA ic h n ve ge in ch c e ei n e e cen in •• n hi n e ei ece e in secen in • n he egin he ece i ece e in secen in • n he egin he ece i hA i n he i e n hA ic h $\forall i$ hich h ve ece e secen hein ci n hi se e e $\forall i$ e i n h i c ch nge c n ing $\forall c$ in eve sing c n ie $\forall i$ n ch i i n e $\forall i$ enee e in een he ecen ie evie e in h i secen in $\forall i$ enee e in en he ecen ie evie e in h i secen e n $\forall i$ enee e in en he ecen ie evie e in h i secen e n $\forall i$ enee e in en he ecen ie evie e in h i secen he ecen ie evie e in he ecen ie evie e in h i secen e n $\forall i$ enee e in e en he ecen ie evie e in h i secen e n $\forall i$ enee e in e en e i n ecen he en ie evie e e in h i secen e e n $\forall i$ e he ecen e i n e e n e i n ecen he i e evie e in h i secen he ecen ie e i e c n h $\forall i$ e chi $\forall i$ i

ig e n e e inecineve $2 \oplus a$ iin in e en ing n he e ie e i i nin eve ing c n ie i i i n he n e h a he e inecine i gh.

c i ne^W c n hiene^W e che cc e e chi enc en n in ch i ing ne^W ch e n ^W e n h chi en^W i c e n n eve ing c n ie ch e v i e n h ghinve ig i n he ch ice e e e e e e e e e e e n h ghinve ig i n he ch ice e e e e e e e en en hei chi en n n hen^W i i e e c e e he c chieving C hi e e chi c i ic e e che n eve en gencie e cen e e ch e - in A e ic n he e i i e gge h hi e h c n e e e cive, he c he he i e highe h n he e e e e i ing ne^W c n hi ing e e che A h gh he e i e e v i i ing ne^W c n hi ing he e a chieving i e n ch en en e e i ince e in he e a i i e n ch en en e e ch i i i e e ch e i i e n ch e e i e e e e e e i i e c e e in he e e civene i i e n ch en en e e e i i e i e e in he e A i c n c n ie e en n ni n i g n gge h n e incen ive e i e h ve nge e in h e gi n ee v ge2 • , 2 • , **F** n 2 • ,

vi ing i ec, ne incenive en in i, i, ch i n ne i e ining \bullet c he e ec ive icie , e v i , e e, e in c n ie \forall he e chi en h ve high eve in e in i e vi i n e^{\forall} , e ing e icine c n i e en en e e e e e en ve \forall c e gene i ch , e e ec ive vi ing i n he e n h e i e (e high en gh en c n in e en hei chi en n ing h ch e ec ive e ch i i he e n i i e
ch ie e, icg ^W hich i, ie h eg ve n, en genc gencie h , vi e, n ing n e n i n eve en gencie ch he P, n n he nie i n e vi ce ch n ing hen h e gencie e h, inc nce ^W i h, i e i gencie , vi e, n gen, e n ei e i e ^W i h ve een en ^W c c ing hec ining nive , i, c e e i n n i e ^W

	Country	UPC Status	Income Level	Most PCR	Recent (year)	PCR 2015
7	Korea Dem Repub	no data	low	_		
8	Korea Republic of	already achieved	middle	96	2000	100
a		on track to achieve	low	69	2000	100
10	Malavsia	off track	middle	90	1994	85
11	Marshall Islands	no data	middle			
12	Mongolia	off track	low	82	1998	_
13	Myanmar	no data	low	_		_
14	Papua New Guinea	off track	low	59	1995	83
15	Philippines	on track to achieve	middle	92	1996	100
16	Palau	no data	middle	_	_	_
17	Samoa	already achieved	middle	99	1997	100
18	Solomon Islands	off track	low	66	1994	71
19	Thailand	off track	middle	90	2000	86
20	Tonga	no data	middle	_	_	_
21	Vanuatu	off track	middle	86	1992	52
22	Viet Nam	already achieved	low	101	2001	100
Eur	ope and Central Asia					
1	Albania	off track	middle	89	1995	57
2	Armenia	off track	low	82	1996	—
3	Azerbaijan	already achieved	low	100	1998	100
4	Belarus	off track	middle	93	1996	74
5	Bosnia & Herzegovina	on track to achieve	middle	88	1999	_
6	Bulgaria	on track to achieve	middle	92	1996	98
7	Croatia	already achieved	middle	96	2001	100
8	Czech Republic	already achieved	middle	109	1995	100
9	Estonia	off track	middle	88	1995	55
10	Georgia	off track	low	82	1998	
11	Hungary	already achieved	middle	102	1995	100
12	Kazakhstan	no data	middle	_	_	_
13	Kyrgyzstan	no data	low			
14	Latvia	on track to achieve	middle	86	1996	100
15	Litnuania	aiready achieved	midale	95	1996	100
10	NOIDOVA Delend	on track to achieve	woi	79	1999	100
10	Polaria	already achieved	middle	90	1990	100
10	Runania	already achieved	middle	90	2001	100
20	Serbia & Montenegro	already achieved	middle	96	2001	100
21	Slovakia	already achieved	middle	97	1996	100
22	Taiikistan	off track	low	77	1996	- 100
23	Macedonia	no data	middle	91	1996	100
24	Turkmenistan	no data	low			
25	Ukraine	on track to achieve	low	94	2002	_
26	Uzbekistan	no data	low	_	—	_
Lat	in America and the Caribb	ean				
1	Antigua & Barbuda	already achieved	middle	98	2000	_
2	Argentina	already achieved	middle	96	2000	100
3	Belize	off track	middle	82	1999	69
4	Bolivia	on track to achieve	middle	72	2000	98
5	Brazil	on track to achieve	middle	72	1999	100
6	Chile	already achieved	middle	99	2000	100
7	Colombia	on track to achieve	middle	85	2000	100
8	Costa Rica	on track to achieve	middle	89	2000	100
9	Cuba	already achieved	middle	—		_
10	Dominica	already achieved	middle	103	2000	100
11	Dominican Republic	off track	middle	62	2000	
12	Ecuador	already achieved	middle	96	1999	100
13	El Salvador	on track to achieve	middle	80	2000	100
14	Grenada	aiready achieved	middle	106	2001	100

15	Guatemala	off track	middle	52	2000	67	
16	Guyana	off track	middle	89	2000	85	
17	Haiti	off track	low	40	1997	71	
18	Honduras	off track	middle	67	2000	69	
19	Jamaica	on track to achieve	middle	94	2000	100	
20	Mexico	already achieved	middle	100	2000	100	
21	Nicaragua	on track to achieve	low	65	2000	95	
22	Panama	on track to achieve	middle	94	2000	100	
23	Paraguay	on track to achieve	middle	78	2000	98	
24	Peru	already achieved	middle	98	2000	100	
25	St. Kitts & Nevis	already achieved	middle	110	2001	100	
26	St. Lucia	already achieved	middle	106	2001	100	
27	St. Vincent & Grenadines	off track	middle	84	2001	—	
28	Suriname	no data	middle	—	—	—	
29	Trinidad & Tobago	off track	middle	94	2000	94	
30	Uruguay	already achieved	middle	98	2000	100	
31	Venezuela	off track	middle	78	1999	55	
Mid	dle East & North Africa						
1	Algeria	on track to achieve	middle	91	1996	100	
2	Bahrain	off track	middle	91	1996	59	
3	Djibouti	seriously off track	middle	30	1999	26	
4	Egypt	already achieved	middle	99	1996	100	
5	Ira4yNdleida2.2831o647(n	niddle)-3643(91)6TJ-24.	55q59 -1.2	25TJ0 -1.25	TD[3)-9	943(Djibout	ti)-8950(serio57)inesi5
26	St. Lucia middle 8	4					
16	Guyanaida2.ck	middle					
28	Suriname	no data	mi	9(1999)	eadCHI	E.0545-0.0)14(Moroc(2026)) [J(4]

e e n, vi C $2 \bullet From Social Assistance to Social evelopment:$ $Targeted Education Subsidies in eveloping Countries hing n <math>\cdot$ C Cen e $G \cdot eve \cdot eve \cdot eve n n n e n i n$ ic e e ch n i e

Re e **e** ... Public Report on Basic Education in India e^V e hi **P**...

v ge , vi 2 •• P n he e , e c c in **t**g n ve **t**nive i c i n. ournal of Modern African Studies

 \mathbb{R} n 2 •• World evelopment Indicators 2002 hing n , C he \mathbb{R} n

 $2 \bullet$ \mathbb{R} , \mathbb{R} i ing n - e ning \mathbb{R} c $\mathbb{A}e$ An $\mathbb{A}e$ c v in . $\mathbb{R}e$ n $\mathbb{R}e$ ic c i n in $\mathbb{C}h$ n hing n < C he $\mathbb{R}e$ n

2 •• , en enghening he n i n c i n n ining in

he C vi ing nive ec n c i n in veve ving C n ie

MELISSA BINDER

hi, e, vieei, e he iine, ench eve, ing c n g ve n_een [₩] inc in // ing en gh/ ce in ec n ch cc_{ente} e chi en ec n ch ge ***** n e c en e e i i n e n c c e n n c e e i 🚛 e e iinie, nini cc ve e h i n n 2 iin ve 2 e h i n hee i e e en i e 2 n 2 i in e e cive ne cen i in⁴⁴ hich ch e e ce e e i in e A he e cininc 2 n 22 iin e e cc \forall hen he e i e e e n he e e i e i e c i ce. c n ie h h ve highe en "men h n e ice , hei inc "me n eginheeimeinhizzenezenhe c chiev ing nive ecn e cin he n inc e he en c n i ie he iin e en e g ve naen chieving nive ia e c i n eve he e hi e i n he e en e ... vi ing he nece ec n ch / ce i ne en i ing / in ne n ing hec nive ec n e c i n

- $\frac{4}{9}$ eve e c i n n he⁴/₂ c n i e c n i n e ve i i n e e e e e i i n chi en in eve i ng c n i e e⁴/₂ een he ge 2 n n en ec n ch Acc ing ne en ive i e e he e chi en⁴/₂ i e e ec n ei c c i ve n ⁴/₂ i h ve⁴/₂ e he h c e e n highe e i e h n h e⁴/₂ i h e e c i n he e e e e i ence h hei ⁴/₂ eve e c i n ⁴/₂ i inhi i ec n ei c ⁴/₂ h hen i n eve he c n i e in⁴/₂ hich he ive² n h ⁴/₂ eve e c i n h ve high c in e e g ne $\frac{1}{2}$ n n ⁴/₂ e e ing

e n heec n eice n ch ing ee ch , ... evië¹/ he h n e ii e.ec e c i n ee nn e n } che nn 2 ●● 2 nn e n } che nn 2 ●● evië¹/ hi i e e

en c hec en e c i n en n hen i ie hi ni c hen e chi en n en e in ch A h gh igh b c c i n c i n ing ni c i c i c e c n i e c n c n ie he eve en n ic e c e h c en ni c e c n ch ing e cen e c i inc e in ... n • he eve ing c n ie in hi e e e i n he c i n n ic g e he g ni i n c n e i c e i n n eve en C n he eve ing c n ie i c n e en c n n c n ie c i n e en c n c i c e i n e eve en en c i c en e en c n n he eve ing c n ie i c n e en c n n i c e e i n c i c e i n e en c n

C. A h gh he c n ie ⁴/₄ i h ni c eh e e e e e h e e n h e e n ch ge i n h e e in eve ing c n ie h e e e e n e e e cen eve ing c n ie n inc e n h e ⁴/₄ inc e e c n ie n n n e A i c n c n e ve vi ing c in e e e i i i c e h e c n i i n e e n n A h ⁴/₄ n e ⁴/₄ h e c ... e e e ch ⁴/₄ e in n c enc c n ve e ⁴/₄ e c n ie

n hi e i e e ni c cc ing he $\sqrt[4]{ing}$ ce e i e e ine he , ic e, en i e e c n ch ing ec n ivi e, hen , e en e e ine he ni c hi i he ni c, hen , e chi en n en e in ch e e ine he i i n c ch ing he e en n i i e c n ie ve ge. • e cen en en e c n ch ge chi en hi \sim e e he. • e cen en e he g chieving, nive e c n e c i n

he in ce hin ii he , i he c in e v eive i e i e e t t t ic , vie ig e , ice en i e vie i e en c i e en i e cin e cen c n t t

An he e c nce n i e en e he i inc i n e^{ψ} een ψ e n //e ec n ch ing A h gh / / vi e en 🛻 en ecnie ccn ch ing eve he e e n c e / n ing e, en i e he nic c c e in hi , e he e e e i he w eve i e vee i ing hec we een nnee i e inghec ... e ecn e c i n he ni c e ^We n // e ec n c e/ e en c n ie **P** n ve ge c n nic , e ec n e cee ^w e ec n c , ∠e cen hi ve gei ∠e^ve , he , e h n i , e ence , e^v een ^we n , , e ec n c in Chin he ve ge i e en i ^w i h Chin i • e cen A h gh n nece i e e en ive he gge hiieie 🙀 🙀 h c nie c n ...e , h eve ... e c n ch ing c e he me ni c C n ie h c en h ve ge i c e, ncie in c $e^{i\psi}$ een he e eve c e_{i} e e_{i} n ec n e c i n 🤎 e ve ge c 🎽 ing he ve ge ve 🔪 h eve heec nie^w vee i ee, ninc eve hee ec e i₄ e₄ening ne[®] in i in ce e ce , e ec n c ^wiie ec c_{ee} ing nic heve c_{ee} ine e in igehi, nei heme

in hech i, in , ive ece cin ecin c vegei i.e i.e. n in , ech ie e ne^W c c e ni c , ivi ing, ic , en ing n ech ing, hen , , e , ic ch en in n e even i hen , e en in, icin i in i , n ^W n , ecc n ie , vi e n ing , iv e ch , $-e^{V}$ in n C i 2 • , c ing, ive en in heece ^W i e in n vee i e n i c ^W hieinc ing heating n ie ^W i hn , i ie^W i e n n ee i e, n, iv een , en e v i , e n o c n ie in he , eC c ing ni c ve , ic ch en n in hi , egive ni c e i e, e cen highe h n hec c c e ve en thece e i en ing he , e c en in, icin i i n vee i e c , ie , e e e eve hee nince e e ecen in hee i e hi ^W gh cc n hehighe c e i ing

he c c n n i ing v i $e^{i\psi}$ e cen e c i n en ing en he ec n eve c c e ni c he ec n ie i n n en en e pec e $e^{i\psi}$ c n ie in e e e c e e e c i n e ne c i n in nce i ... e i n n en e c n hi e egene ec e he f c i i c i n ec n ch g c h nge $e^{i\psi}$ een ... n ... C h ven en en e he c n ie $i\psi$ i h n en en e c h gh he h ve een inc e ing c e i e c ing egi n ve ge

vie ein nic egin ninc e he e e he n hec nie h ici e in he e en in ne nin he ic n cience ec g nie he ne nin A ci in he v in cin Achieve en n ne he nie e he p n n he nie in e ng he A h gh n 2 • he in cin cin ke

, ici, e in e he e, e e c e i ec me e he e ec ivene ne c i n e c in he A, en i, vi e i c n ie

 $e h^{\psi} h^{\psi}$ ihin egin ne en e i e^{ψ} ihinc e he e e i i $\psi e n$, e i e inc eg , c egin h gh he egin , e n Cen A i en , ic high e n , h n A ic h , ic ψ e he ψe i e inc eg , e hi i c n i e , ev i i n e ng egin ψ i h h n A ic n h A i he ψ en – ge n evi i n e ce in ic e h he ei ψ i e nge , c e even , c n ie in he e egin n inc eg ,

Table 1: Data Available for Calculating Unit Costs

		Children 12–17 Years of Age in 2000							
		All		Not en	rolled				
	Number of Countries	Number in millions	Percent	Number in millions	Percent				
Complete data in at least one year between 1998 and 2000	60	405.5	64.5	198.2	60.9				
Complete data in different years between 1998 and 2000	9	16.1	2.6	8.9	2.7				
Imputed based on partial data	61	187.9	29.9	107.5	33.1				
Insufficient data to impute	14	19.0	3.0	est. 10.6	3.3				
TOTAL	144	628.5		325.2					

Source: Author's calculations based on World Development Indicators and UNESCO-UIS and Population Division of the Department of Economic and Social Affairs of the United Nations Secretariat, *World Populatio Prospects: The 00 Revisio*, and *World rba i atio Prospects: The 00 Revisio*. Available online: http://esa.un.org/unpp.

Note: Population figures for this age group are provided directly by the UN Population Division (see above). The estimate of those not enrolled was derived as follows. First, I estimated the number of children 12–17 who were enrolled in school by multiplying the total population in this age group by the most recently available net enrollment rate between 1998 and 2000 for the 96 countries reporting this statistic directly. I imputed the net enrollment rate for an additional 35 countries that reported the gross enrollment rate, using the predicted value from a regression of the ratio of the net to gross enrollment rate on per capita income, 12–17 year-old population, spending on secondary schooling as a percent of GDP, and five regional dummy variables. For 13 countries with no enrollment data, I used the average regional enrollment rate. Second, I subtracted the estimated number enrolled from the total 12–17 population.

A ic $n - in A_{me}$ ic Ag in ge n evi in gge cnie evi i n^{ψ} i hin inc $meg \neq n$ eg in

he^W en c n ie i e in A, en i c e even e in , e n ^W e i e inc e A n e ve c e h he highe en e n i c h ghn ^W e h n ve ge ni c he ve e e en i n c e n c n ie in he e i he n i e c e e n n c i hi h^W h en e n ni c e highe c n ie

								ALL		TIMSS	
		SSA	SA	EA&P	ME&NA	LA&C	E&CA	Not weighted	Weighted	Not weighted	Weighted

Number of countries

hn he $(\mathbf{a}, \mathbf{e}) \stackrel{\forall \psi}{=} h e An i ing e in ic e h he i.e$ $ence e i ic igni ic n h ghn ni c c <math>(\mathbf{a}, \mathbf{e}) \stackrel{\forall \psi}{=} i hin$ inc $(\mathbf{a}, \mathbf{e}, \mathbf{g}) \stackrel{\forall \psi}{=} n$ he c $(\mathbf{a}, \mathbf{e}) \stackrel{\forall \psi}{=} i hin he (\mathbf{a}, \mathbf{e}) \stackrel{\forall \psi}{=} i hin he (\mathbf{a}, \mathbf{e}) \stackrel{\forall \psi}{=} i hin he (\mathbf{a}, \mathbf{e}) \stackrel{\forall \psi}{=} i hin he (\mathbf{e}) \stackrel{\forall \psi}{=} i h e e e e e e (\mathbf{e}) \stackrel{\forall \psi}{=} i e$





Source: Author's calculations based on enrollment rates and per capita income reported in the World Development Indicators.

ig e h^W h c e e high c e e^W i hinc me he eg e i n ine h^W ne c e he ie hA ic ^W hich h e c e e^W 2, ginc mee, in e en he more v i i n in e c e even^W hen hA ic i inc e A e in heA en i h^W ne hec n ie c n i e e high e ming n e he me e e in e ve i he^W e ming c n ie e c n i e e high e ming n e he me e hi

vie heevienceh he eve eve eve en heteve mingchie

e e en en e e c i n in nce n e vice e ive 👝 en high n 🦞 / e. 👝 ing c n ie n e h ee / e. 👝 nce c i e i c n ie h h ve highe h n_{ℓ} e ic e inc me_2 c n ie h h ve highe h n ℓ e ic e inc $e^{i\psi}$ i hin egi n n c n ie h h vehighe c e h n_{ℓ} e ice ice ic igni ic n i le ence // e in fine h ci e i high / e ming c n ie h ve igni ic n highe g n ne en men e he i e ence e e n nce high e ming c n ie e ive inc e ne e ec ing he e ce/ i n / e . e nce . / e n c n ie in inc eg , ^w henc n ie ec e ^w i hin egi n he i e ence e 🚚 e^{tt}h en e 🚬 i ge igh / e 🚛 ing c n ie eve ge ç, he e cinne he ciei, en 👝 🖞 / e. 🛻 ing c n ie in he h e hee c i n ge i e en w ec n ch ing i ec e

[,] igni ic nce i e e 🚛 ine 🔪 e

Figure 2: TIMSS Math Score, Predicted Score, and Log Per Capita GDP



Source: Author's calculations based on test scores from the 1999 Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS) and per capita income reported in the World Development Indicators.

Note: Predictions based on a regression model that uses region and income interactions.

In c , e cen , e c , i inc , e e igni ic n $\frac{W}{W}$ e n e he , e e h gh, e ni c e igni ic n highe high e , e e ive inc , e ne , e e igni c n highe he ci e i h ve high e c , i inc , e even h gh he e ge e ive inc , e hi e, in $\frac{W}{W}$ h, e e , e , e c nh ve highe ni c n $\frac{W}{W}$ e e c , i ni c he , e e i , e e n ee hi i c e in ic e in ig e $\frac{W}{W}$ he e g e e n , e highe inc , e c n ie , e , ve he eg e i n ine in , ng he e vice e ive , e e he e e i n ei , e , e c en $\frac{W}{W}$ e c n i e $\frac{W}{W}$ i h e e h n , e ic e n he i e c n i e h h $\frac{W}{W}$ e h n , e ic e en , e hen , e , i , e e che i $\frac{W}{W}$ e h n , e ic e en , e n hen , e , i , e e che i $\frac{W}{W}$ e h n , e ic e en , e n ie n e heinc , e n ci e i n

Hece hec n ie in he c i n $\cdot \cdot \cdot e$ e eec n e e en i n h i i in e e ing h eve igni i c n i le ence e e ge n e he e e A^W e n e he e e high e ni i n e e^W een he i n e c n e en e n e highe ni i n e e^W een he i n e c n e ve n c n i e Ve e e ei i n e i i c e n e he c i e i n e ive inc e n c i e i n high e ing c n i e h ve igni i c m e n g he c n i e n i heg h e e i c e e c i n n i e e e e e e i n e n e he c i e

 $\frac{\psi}{\psi}$ c nc in he e in hi e^{ψ} een e m nce n he he $\frac{\psi}{\psi}$ e c in in nce in ic m en ing n ec n ch ing h e c in m en ing n ni c

e inve ig e $\frac{1}{2}$ he he he ci i n $\frac{1}{2}$ een e n nce n in nce n evice eive v i e v ie incree he e nce e i e ence ngincreg n ic $\frac{1}{2}$ i hin he $\frac{1}{2}$ incree g ni c e cen e c i incree e igni ic n $\frac{1}{2}$ e igni c n highe n e e igni c n $\frac{1}{2}$ e igni c n highe n e e igni c n $\frac{1}{2}$ e igni c n ie A i incree e ege ec n e c i n en ing h e e c i neren i e high e me ng he $\frac{1}{2}$ incree n i e en ge h e h n $\frac{1}{2}$ e he h n $\frac{1}{2}$ e e hi e ni e ec he g in e i e $\frac{1}{2}$ incree n i e ec he g in e i e $\frac{1}{2}$ incree n i e he he e c i n e e i n e i e i e ne ec n ie ec he ec he

e e e he n e e n ing i ic echni e h 🧤 cnie he in e.ec e cin in ncevi, e n , e , en nce ege he ei , e ege in he ninc ee n ninc en egi nine ci n n e ci n en ingin g 2 ecn en ingine cinevenie hegnic n he g ni c / e cen / e c / i inc messec e e c n ie e cininnevi, e he 🖛 ei e ice 2 c n ie, inc e he e vice e ive v i e ^w e ic he e even e e n 🚛 ee 🚬 e zeci ic i n i 🚛 e 🛛 hec n ie inc e in he egeinnihe & ine cinzeningi igni icni e^wih ee c_me e <u>m</u> nce e ive inc_meim ve^wih highe ni c $\forall i$ en $\forall i$ h highe c e cen e c iinc 👝 e e ive inc 👝 e n egi n e n e en n he eve ni c , e g in $\forall en c n ie \forall i h high ni c$ e cen e c e i inc me in he heec man e h W e nn i i**n**i h in e ⁴/₁ he e e e ⁴/₁ e

Table 4: Education Finance and Service Variables for Countries with Better and Worse

 than Predicted Net Enrollment Rates Relative to Income and Region, by Income

		Low incor	ne	Lower-middle income			Upper-middle income		
	N	Better than pre- dicted	Worse than pre- dicted	N	Better than pre- dicted	Worse than pre- dicted	N	Better than average	Worse than average
GER	38	48.9	29.6	30	79.6	58.6	24	88.0	79.0
NER	38	42.8	24.6	30	66.1	47.1	24	76.2	63.5
Public expenditure on education (% GDP)	32	4.1	3.5	24	4.9	4.0	23	5.2	5.3
Spending on sec- ondary schooling (% of total educa- tion spending)	17	41.8	27.9	19	31.1	48.1	18	34.1	40.2
Unit cost in 2002 U.S. dollars	38	\$95	\$130	29	\$364	\$378	24	\$1102	\$1280
Unit cost as % of per capita income	38	23.4	33.6	29	16.1	23.2	24	19.3	23.5
Transition rate from primary to secondary levels	26	90.0	62.7	21	87.5	85.4	18	88.1	91.8
Trained teachers	9	68.1	74.5	8	70.7	86.5	0	NA	NA
Pupils per teacher	22	26.4	24.7	22	20.9	17.2	22	16.3	14.8
Repetition rate	22	7.1	13.9	21	6.5	6.7	18	5.8	6.8
Per capita GDP	38	\$386	\$23	92	\$2150	\$1678	24	\$5730	\$5158

Source: WDI and UNESCO-UIS. Unit costs are author's calculations from these sources.

Note: Significant differences in bold font. Significance using one-tailed tests is at the 5 percent level for all variables except spending on secondary schooling as a share of total education spending for low income and upper-middle-income countries, pupils per teacher for lower-middle-income countries, and GER for upper-middle-income countries, which are all significant at the 10 percent level.

e en e i e h c n i e e e e in e i cienc n v i he i i i h he $\frac{W}{V}$ e c e i e i e i e c n c $\frac{W}{V}$ he e c i cice e n e en ing eve ni c n n inc e e e g r n n e e g i n n inc e e g r

^W i h n ing hi , g, ic eci i n eve c n ie , en h ve gene e e ce en ec n ch ing c , e ve ^W c hi gge h i i , i e chieve nive ec n ch ing^W i h e , ne h n even he , i i i ce i e e ne he e n e h c e i e enece e h ^W he e ^W c e chieve n ^W he he n he c n e c i ce e ^W he e

, e , i e he nce in i ic e i n hi e^{ψ} een ni c n en , en c , e he eg ing n i gge igni ic n in , e^{ψ} een en , en n he h e , e ev e , ic , en ing n e c i n hi he e e , i he g , i ning c , e^{ψ} een

, inve ingine c i n e $A h^{\psi} n e^{\psi}$ he e i n high eaing c n chieve e e c e $\psi e e$ ni c h n he ve ge c n hi gg h ni c ving e i ei e e ch c n e in h ψ e c n i e e e ψ i h e

A h ghii e n hecze hi en en ine ve ne n ingc c n i e ence ine c i n in nce n c e i ce i i e e e ch hi e i e i n n he e i n ni c e c i n in c n ie wi i h highe h n e i ce c c ice en en e he ci ing e n e n ce i n e i e ni c ci e wi h e e c e he e i n i e ive w g c n i e c e n ing he ci e i eve e in he evi ec i n high e e e ive ince n high e e e e ive ince n egi n

cnie^{ψ} en ive, in cen in heie ei in e enchage n ne^{ψ} ch ce e ece e ne^{ψ} en ee ^{ψ} ih n ^{ψ} nce. e ei in enghene^{ψ} en ^{ψ} e **1** n e hi cen i nic e i e i i ie, hen e e ne^{ψ} en ^{ψ} h nee een e chieve given ne en en hin e i in e, hec en e ei in e he e eine he i heg **Table 6**: Unit Costs (in Constant 2002 U.S. Dollars) under Different Scenarios, by

 Region and Income Group, per Enrolled Student

	SSA	SA	EA&P	ME&NA	LA&C	E&CA	Total per country	Total per student
		Pr	esent Ur	nit Costs	6			
Low Income	\$128	\$86	\$136	\$249	\$122	\$125	\$127	\$126
Lower-Middle Income	417	82	382	369	325	307	337	244
Upper-Middle Income	820		1417	2180	919	1157	1219	884
Country mean	199	85	307	927	544	505	412	
Mean cost per student	257	117	168	571	577	462	_	296

	Best Practice by Income Group										
Low Income	66	66	66	66	66	66	66	66			
Lower-Middle Income	290	290	290	290	290	290	290	290			
Upper-Middle Income	877	_	877	877	877	877	877	877			
Country mean	139	122	203	459	505	398	302	_			
Mean cost per student	138	71	247	338	725	329		292			

	Best Practice by Region and Income Group									
Low Income	75	67	23	249	222	93	76	64		
Lower-Middle Income	637	82	139	384	312	219	299	221		
Upper-Middle Income	785		1417	1555	877	902	1014	938		
Country mean	171	69	145	741	527	384	336			
Mean cost per student	231	67	132	492	734	300	—	268		

Source: Author's calculations based on data from WDI and UNESCO-UIS.

Note: Best-practice country cost is the median unit cost by income group or region and income group for countries with net enrollment rates higher than predicted by regressions of region and income interactions.

in $c n i e^{\psi}$ en ive ge $e_2 \bullet n_2 \bullet$ chieving nive ec n ch ing

Table 7: Additional Spending (in Constant 2002 U.S. Dollars) to Achieve Immediate 90

 Percent Net Enrollment Rates at the Secondary Level under Alternative Cost and

 Absorption Assumptions

Present cost	6	Best practice by income group	Best practice by region and income group
Population to Cost be enrolled per new (1000s) enrollee	Total cost (millions)		

c n ie inc e g / he e ne^y en eec n , • ie ing $ne^{i/2}$, en ing eve $(2, i i n^{i/2})$ i h n ch nge in he e, e i in en jin^Wih jecenejeiin e ^enec cie 🛛 👝 he 🚛 e i n c 🔍 e 🧳 cice c n ie 🔪 inc 🚛 e g 📝 n egi n he e ne^w en eec e ^w e i , n ? ^w i h ne^w en ing ., iinn, iine en ing nhe e e iin 👝 in he e , c ice , en ing inc e ving n c en en e en inc n ie ^w he e / e en c e cee e / cice c he c e 👝 c n ie n 🚛 e in nce he e ving n c en en e cee he en ing nee e en ne^W en he e c n ie e n ince in he hi^wi i hei ving ce e e , en ing in he c n ie he c n ie he e , c ice c e cee / e en c // he e c n ie : ce inc e e c ... en e en e he ^{vy} in e ch, ne h^{vy} h he <u>m</u> n, en ing i ece hee en i i e h e he nee e chieve nive ec n ch ing

 $e h^{\psi}$ hec e i e e g ince ing heen e nive cce $2 \cdot 2 \cdot 2 \cdot 1$ ing e en c n e cicec ince e n egin n e cinge e i i n e e e e e ve he e i hec c i n inc e i i n c c v ing inc e e i ing en n e he e cice cen i he e e e n n g ψ hin en e e hich i he e i n g ψ h e eve i ng c n i e h e hec ving ve n e en e i e h n e e e n h c e n h ve e en e i e e c n h e e i e e n h e e i e n ch ge, $in e^{\psi} een e n 2$, e e c hee i $e e h^{\psi}$ h ince ing ch c ce chieve nive ec n ch ing $2 e^{\psi}$ c iin nn n e e e n c n e e iin e n 2 iin nn n e e cice c ih g e cinin he e e iin e e cen he ve ge nn c n e he e e n n e cice c c e e 2 n 2 iin<math>e e cive he i e ence e^{ψ} een he e i e^{ψ} ih n ch nge in c $c e n e e iin e n he e i e^{\psi}$ ih e cice c n $e e cen e e iin i e n he e i e^{\psi}$ ih e cice c n

In e 2 e i e e he ve ge nn c e, n e c i n e chieve nive en en i 2 i i n e en c n e e i i n e e cicec n e e i i n e he c 22 i i n 2 e cen e c i n ve 2 e wi h nive en Repetition rates unchanged

Repetition 7% or less

Table 9: Indicators of Median Country Burden and External Aid Requirements for Achieving 90Percent Net Enrollment Rates, Average Annual Spending over 25 Years (Spending in billions of constant 2002 U.S. dollars)

	Rep	etition rate	es unchai	nged	Repetition rates 7% or less			
	15-year	horizon	25-year	horizon	15-year	horizon	25-year	horizon
	Present costs	Best prac- tice costs	Present costs	Best prac- tice costs	Present costs	Best prac- tice costs	Present costs	Best prac- tice costs
Low Income Countries								
Total present spending=\$15.3								
Additional spending needed	\$20.3	\$8.6	\$13.8	\$6.1	\$16.9	\$7.0	\$13.2	\$5.9
As factor of present spending	3.2	2.0	2.2	1.3	2.5	1.4	2.2	1.2
As share of GDP	2.8	1.2	2.0	0.6	2.1	0.8	1.9	0.6
Foreign aid required after country spends best practice GDP	\$16.9	\$6.7	\$11.1	\$4.7	\$13.6	\$5.1	\$10.5	\$4.5
Country burden as factor of present spending after foreign aid paid	0.20	0.08	0.19	0.03	0.16	0.06	0.14	0.02
Lower-Middle Income Countrie	es							
Total present spending=\$35.9								
Additional spending needed	\$10.9	\$13.5	\$6.5	\$9.6	\$6.4	\$9.3	\$5.4	\$8.6
As factor of present spending	0.25	0.12	0.11	0.01	0.11	0.06	0.07	0
As share of GDP	0.3	0.2	0.1	0.1	0.2	0.1	0.1	0.2
Foreign aid required after coun- try spends best practice GDP	\$5.3	\$5.8	\$3.3	\$4.1	\$2.9	\$3.5	\$2.7	\$3.5
Country burden as factor of present spending after foreign aid paid	<0.01	<0.01	<0.01	<0.01	<0.01	<0.01	<0.01	<0.01
Upper-Middle Income Countrie	es							
Total present spending=\$41.8								
Additional spending needed	\$13.4	\$12.7	\$7.9	\$9.3	\$6.0	\$8.5	\$5.7	\$7.8
As factor of present spending	0.05	0.01	<0.01	<0.01	<0.01	<0.01	<0.01	<0.01
As share of GDP	0.07	0.02	<0.01	<0.01	<0.01	<0.01	<0.01	<0.01
Foreign aid required after coun- try spends best practice GDP								

ince e en ing e cen ve c en en ing n ec n e c i n heince e e i e ince ec n ie e h n e cen c n ie e e i e c e i i inie e e cen c he e i e gge e en n ing e i e en e i e en c w ince e c n ie e h i n hec e h i n n i e ince c n ie e he e h i n hec e ine e en e i e en i i i n nn hi e n i e e h e n i e e en e i e en i vi e cici eve e en i nce in e n i e he i e e e e c h e he i ennie eve e en c w hich ince e i cing e e e ve n h nge chieving ni ve i e e cin n i ving he h i i ennie ec 2 •• h e ive hec en eve e en i i i ni ge e

C I IN UNI 25 5 C N 2 UC I N

he eg ing i c i n gge h e en ing n i e h i n c c e n e e i i n e he nn in nci en vi ing en gh ch ce chieve nive ec n ch ing in eve i ng c n ie $\frac{W}{i}$ e $\frac{e^{W}}{een 22}$, i i n n he vec c i n eve equing ich en i in he ing $\frac{W}{i}$ c high c n ie i i n e e e e e e e i i n e $\frac{W}{i}$ h he e $\frac{W}{i}$ e i e c e e e e e e e i n e $\frac{W}{i}$ h he e $\frac{W}{i}$
 Table 1: Study Population Countries by Region, Income Classification, and Population

 12–17 Years of Age

 Table 1: Study Population Countries by Region, Income Classification, and Population

 12–17 Years of Age, continued

	Income group	Population 12–17 Years of Age (1000s)
South Asia		
Afghanistan	Low	2,902
Bangladesh	Low	19,019
Bhutan	Low	295
India	Low	127,056
Maldives	Lower-middle	44
Nepal	Low	3,176
Pakistan	Low	19,830
Sri Lanka	Lower-middle	2,134

East Asia & Pacific		
Cambodia	Low	2,196
China	Lower-middle	132,931
Dem. People's Rep. of Korea	Low	2,228
Fiji	Lower-middle	104
Indonesia	Low	26,201
Lao PDR	Low	739
Malaysia	Upper-middle	2,725
Micronesia, Fed. Sts.	Lower-middle	16
Mongolia	Low	367
Myanmar	Low	5,884
Papua New Guinea	Low	700
Philippines	Lower-middle	10,267
Samoa	Lower-middle	25
Solomon Islands	Low	62
Thailand	Lower-middle	6,738
Timor-Leste	Low	130
Tonga	Lower-middle	14
Vanuatu	Lower-middle	29
Viet Nam	Low	10,534

	Middle	East	&	North	Africa
--	--------	------	---	-------	--------

Algeria	Lower-middle	4,370
Djibouti	Lower-middle	89
Egypt	Lower-middle	9,630
Iran, Islamic Rep.	Lower-middle	11,046
Iraq	Lower-middle	3,292
Jordan	Lower-middle	690
Lebanon	Upper-middle	427
Libyan Arab Jamahiriya	Upper-middle	804
Malta	Upper-middle	34
Могоссо	Lower-middle	3,930
Oman	Upper-middle	333
Palestinian Autonomous Territories	Lower-middle	443
Saudi Arabia	Upper-middle	2,788
Syrian Arab Republic	Lower-middle	2,631
Tunisia	Lower-middle	1,269
Yemen	Low	2,697

THE COST OF PROVIDING2 720 0 0NIVERSALOPROVSECONDAR18Y20 0 0EDUCA74TION20 0 0IN0PROVDEVELOP2 720 0 0

Table 2: Study Population Countries included in TIMSS

	Income group	Region
Bulgaria	Lower-middle	E&CA
Czech Republic	Upper-middle	E&CA
Hungary	Upper-middle	E&CA
Indonesia	Low	EA&P
Iran, Islamic Rep.	Lower-middle	ME&NA
Jordan	Lower-middle	ME&NA
Latvia	Upper-middle	E&CA
Lithuania	Upper-middle	E&CA
Malaysia	Upper-middle	EA&P
Могоссо	Lower-middle	ME&NA
Philippines	Lower-middle	EA&P
Republic of Moldova	Low	E&CA
Romania	Lower-middle	E&CA
Russian Federation	Lower-middle	E&CA
Slovak Republic	Upper-middle	E&CA
South Africa	Lower-middle	SSA
Thailand	Lower-middle	EA&P
Former Yugoslav Rep. of Macedonia	Lower-middle	E&CA
Tunisia	Lower-middle	ME&NA
Turkey	Lower-middle	E&CA

Source: 1999 TIMSS and World Bank 2003 list of developing countries.

Table 3: Best Practice Countries by Performance Criteria

	Net Enrollment Rate		TIMSS
	High relative to income	High relative to income & region	High relative to income ¹
Sub-Saharan Africa			
Botswana	Х	Х	
Eritrea		Х	
Gambia		Х	
Ghana		Х	
Liberia		Х	
Malawi		Х	
Mauritius	Х	Х	
Namibia		Х	
Sierra Leone		Х	
South Africa		Х	0
Swaziland		Х	
Zimbabwe		Х	
South Asia			
None			
East Asia & Pacific			
Indonesia			Х
Malaysia	Х	Х	0
Mongolia	Х	Х	
Philippines	Х	Х	0
Samoa	Х	Х	
Tonga	Х	Х	
Viet Nam	Х	Х	
Middle East & North Africa			
Algeria	Х	Х	
Egypt	Х	Х	

Table 3: Best Practice Countries by Performance Criteria, continued

	Net Enrollment Rate		TIMSS
	High relative to income	High relative to income & region	High relative to income ¹
Chile	Х	Х	
Colombia		Х	
Jamaica	Х	Х	
Nicaragua		Х	
Panama	Х	Х	
Peru	Х	Х	
St. Lucia	Х	Х	
Trinidad and Tobago	Х	Х	
Uruguay	Х		
Europe & Central Asia			
Albania	Х		
Armenia	Х		
Azerbaijan	Х	Х	
Belarus	Х		
Unit Costs

1. Total Education Expenditure = [Share of GDP in Education Spending (current and capital)] X [2000 Country

Fine ei n Chi, he 2 ● , ne i n n e gene i n i i in ch ing he C e e i c. Economic evelopment and Cultural Change ● 2 2 ...

K (vi 2 •• Measuring Global Educational Progress. C (i ge A) Ame ic n Ac e(i) A n cience

hie n − c Ch e \subseteq c gn e² • , in ncing i c i n. A e e n $\stackrel{\text{w}}{\longrightarrow}$ i $\stackrel{\text{t}}{\twoheadrightarrow}$

If n IF A in ing n h A chieving Universal Primary Education by 2015: A Chance for Every Child. hing n C he IF n.

C c gh Ch i he $\forall i$ h ei h $-e^{i i}$ in . . Educating All the Children: Strategies for Primary Schooling in the South C en n e

A e i ing he c ini e c in ceni e ch Cene A A c in ceni e ch Cene

/ ev n h n n n g e i e n ic. ^w n n² ●● , / eve , ee n c . ; ^k n , ing / e hing n / C he ; ^k n

nn , in C i ; ch, nn 2 •• The Consequences of Global Educational Expansion: Social Science Perspectives C , i ge A A e ic n Ac e A n cience

n e Ame ic n, eve , en R n, R ... Facing Up to Inequality in atin America: Economic and Social Progress in atin America, 1998–1999 Report. hing n C n e Ame ic n, eve , en R n.

imene mene, he ce cin C i cC ncin imen nec ch in - in Americ.

Con., a

Melissa Binderin ciez e in hezezen cnenic he inive i $e^{i\psi}$ e ic $i\psi$ he e he e che c e n e cnenic n — in Ame ic n evezen ch he e e ch c n ce n e c i n eci i n in he ini e e n e ic he h $i\psi$ i en n he e i n hize $i\psi$ eene c i n n heze he h $i\psi$ gegzin he ini e e

Paul Glewwein cieże in heżeżen Ażie c nanic heżnive i inne ^W he e he e che c e n ec nane ic heżnice c nanic ec naniceve zen new n heżie e ch. c eze e c ive nevezing c nie n inc e heż ^W ing zice c i nchi he hine i nz ve n he e ign h eh ve evi he^W eni ec nani in heżeve zen e e ch. c heż n e h^W ze in n c n c e e e ch na n c nie in A ic A i — in Aze ic n he i e

Meng Zhao i h, en in he, e, en A, ie c n eic he nive i inne e e e ch c e n eve en ec n ec n ic $\frac{1}{2}$ i h, ec in e e in e c i n he h n g ic e in Chin he h $\frac{1}{2}$ e c n n he \mathbb{R} n n ing ngi in ve c ec e in Chin n c c n n e c i n in A ic

THE PROJECT ON UNIVERSAL BASIC AND SECONDARY EDUCATION

/ iece e Chen, ceee n C i inve iie n / vi / v inve i heAc e / ec n i vi ec n c i n / A i / n ing eie i i ci in ie he i n e en n c n e ence / vi ing n e c i n high i chi en in he^W / ing g / e inve ig ing n e / ic inc ing tic c n ne c i n e / n i n hi e c i n eve / en c ne ence ining nive e c i n e n e c i n e / n i n g n e en nive e c i n ic n ce e c i n e c nive e c i n he h n e c i n he A / ec i // e g n he i i n e e n n n h e h n e c i n he A / ec i A n cience

ADVISORY COMMITTEE

-e ie; e ^w i American Academy of Arts and Sciences

nc ; fi Center for Global evelopment

n in Ford Foundation

^W & ne Harvard University

Se ge ng <u>e</u> Academy for Educational evelopment

i h e h ni National University of Singapore he ine \leftarrow Rockefeller Foundation enne h $\stackrel{\otimes V}{\leftarrow}$ i

Columbia University

hn ee New York, NY

e e ch Earth Institute, Columbia University

Gene , e ing Council on Foreign Relations

c. e 👝 n Zuckerman & Associates, C

e e in e i n e e c n c e c n i n i n e e c n c e c n i n i n e e c n c i n A e i c n A c e A n cience ving e C a i g A h ne h ne h e c g h e c g c c c c c c

THE AMERICAN ACADEMY OF ARTS AND SCIENCES

n e in \bullet he A_me ic n Ac e_m A n cience i nin e n i n e ne cie c m e he⁴/₂ e ing cien i ch i ine e e n i ce e i h c en mem e hi $\bullet \bullet \bullet A_m$ e i c n e ⁴/₂ n $\bullet \bullet$ eign n e_m e he Ac e_m h m g

- ingevicen h ghn i ciic cinineec i e n he eve i en ive,

e ing, ic eng gemen n he e ch nge i e ^w i h mee ing c n e ence
n m, i inging ive e e cive he e min i n i e c mm n c nce n

- en ing në^{ψ} gene in . ch n hin e h gh he në^{ψ} e , i he i i ing ch g $\stackrel{\bullet}{\underset{\bullet}{\leftarrow}}$

−. n ing e ce ence (e ec ing , e e hi , en n ^v/, e en in) nge i ci ine n / e i n